

Holland & Knight LLP
400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Tel: 213.896.2400
Fax: 213.896.2450

HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP
Zachary C. Frampton (303225)
Abraham J. Colman (146933)
400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Phone: (213) 896-2413
zac.frampton@hklaw.com
abe.colman@hklaw.com

*Attorneys for Defendants
Hyundai Capital America, and
Coastline Recovery Services, Inc.,*

**UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT
CENTRAL DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA**

GENE WECHSLER and BRIDGETTE
WECHSLER,

Plaintiffs,

vs.

HYUNDAI CAPITAL AMERICA dba
HYUNDAI MOTOR FINANCE
COMPANY; COASTLINE
RECOVERY SERVICES, INC.; and
DOES 1 through 100, inclusive,

Defendants.

Case No. 2:22-cv-08599-AB-Ex

**STIPULATED PROTECTIVE
ORDER AND
CONFIDENTIALITY
AGREEMENT**

Judge Andre Birotte, Jr.
Mag. Judge Charles F. Eick
Complaint Filed: Nov. 23, 2022

[Removed from Los Angeles County
Superior Court Case No.: 21-ST-CV-
28093]

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

1. PURPOSES AND LIMITATIONS

Discovery in this action is likely to involve production of confidential, proprietary, or private information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecuting this litigation may be warranted. Accordingly, the parties hereby stipulate to and petition the Court to enter the following Stipulated Protective Order. The parties acknowledge that his Order does not confer blanket protections on all disclosures or responses to discovery and that the protection it affords from public disclosure and use extends only to the limited information or items that are entitled to confidential treatment under the applicable legal principles.

GOOD CAUSE STATEMENT

This action is likely to involve confidential, financial, and/or proprietary information for which special protection from public disclosure and from use for any purpose other than prosecution of this action is warranted. Such confidential and proprietary materials and information consist of, among other things, confidential business or financial information, information regarding confidential business practices, or other confidential, commercial information (including information implicating privacy rights of third parties), information otherwise generally unavailable to the public, or which may be privileged or otherwise protected from disclosure under state or federal statutes, court rules, case decisions, or common law. Accordingly, to expedite the flow of information, to facilitate the prompt resolution of disputes over confidentiality of discovery materials, to adequately protect information the parties are entitled to keep confidential, to ensure that the parties are permitted reasonable necessary uses of such material in preparation for and in the conduct of trial, to address their handling at the end of the litigation, and serve the ends of justice, a protective order for such information is justified in this matter. It is the intent of the parties that information will

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

not be designated as confidential for tactical reasons and that nothing be so designated without a good faith belief that it has been maintained in a confidential, non-public manner, and there is good cause why it should not be part of the public record of this case.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT OF PROCEDURE FOR FILING UNDER SEAL

The parties further acknowledge, as set forth in Section 12.3, below, that this Stipulated Protective Order does not entitle them to file confidential information under seal; Local Civil Rule 79-5 sets forth the procedures that must be followed and the standards that will be applied when a party seeks permission from the court to file material under seal.

There is a strong presumption that the public has a right of access to judicial proceedings and records in civil cases. In connection with non-dispositive motions, good cause must be shown to support a filing under seal. *See Kamakana v. City and County of Honolulu*, 447 F.3d 1172, 1176 (9th Cir. 2006); *Phillips v. Gen. Motors Corp.*, 307 F.3d 1206, 1210-11 (9th Cir. 2002); *Makar-Welbon v. Sony Electronics, Inc.*, 187 F.R.D. 576, 577 (E.D. Wis. 1999) (even stipulated protective orders require good cause showing), and a specific showing of good cause or compelling reasons with proper evidentiary support and legal justification, must be made with respect to Protected Material that a party seeks to file under seal. The parties' mere designation of Disclosure or Discovery Material as CONFIDENTIAL does not—without the submission of competent evidence by declaration, establishing that the material sought to be filed under seal qualifies as confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable—constitute good cause.

Further, if a party requests sealing related to a dispositive motion or trial, then compelling reasons, not only good cause, for the sealing must be shown, and the relief sought shall be narrowly tailored to serve the specific interest to be protected. *See Pintos v. Pacific Creditors Ass'n.*, 605 F.3d 665, 677-79 (9th Cir. 2010). For each item or type of information, document, or thing sought to be filed or introduced

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

under seal in connection with a dispositive motion or trial, the party seeking protection must articulate compelling reasons, supported by specific facts and legal justification, for the requested sealing order. Again, competent evidence supporting the application to file documents under seal must be provided by declaration.

Any document that is not confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable in its entirety will not be filed under seal if the confidential portions can be redacted. If documents can be redacted, then a redacted version for public viewing, omitting only the confidential, privileged, or otherwise protectable portions of the document, shall be filed. Any application that seeks to file documents under seal in their entirety should include an explanation of why redaction is not feasible.

2. DEFINITIONS

2.1 Action: the above-captioned case.

2.2 Challenging Party: a Party or Non-Party that challenges the designation of information or items under this Order.

2.3 “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items: information (regardless of how it is generated, stored or maintained) or tangible things that qualify for protection under Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(c), and as specified above in the Good Cause Statement.

2.4 Counsel (without qualifier): Outside Counsel of Record and House Counsel (as well as their support staff).

2.5 Designating Party: a Party or Non-Party that designates information or items that it produces in disclosures or in responses to discovery as “CONFIDENTIAL.”

2.6 Disclosure or Discovery Material: all items or information, regardless of the medium or manner in which it is generated, stored, or maintained (including, among other things, testimony, transcripts, and tangible

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

things), that are produced or generated in disclosures or responses to discovery in this matter.

2.7 Expert: a person with specialized knowledge or experience in a matter pertinent to the litigation who has been retained by a Party or its counsel to serve as an expert witness or as a consultant in this Action.

2.8 House Counsel: attorneys who are employees of a party to this Action. House Counsel does not include Outside Counsel of Record or any other outside counsel.

2.9 Non-Party: any natural person, partnership, corporation, association or other legal entity not named as a Party to this action.

2.10 Outside Counsel of Record: attorneys who are not employees of a party to this action but are retained to represent or advise a party to this Action and have appeared in this action on behalf of that party or are affiliated with a law firm which has appeared on behalf of that party, and includes support staff.

2.11 Party: any party to this action, including all of its officers, directors, employees, consultants, retained experts, and Outside Counsel of Record (and their support staffs).

2.12 Producing Party: a Party or Non-Party that produces Disclosure or Discovery Material in this action.

2.13 Professional Vendors: persons or entities, not employed by or affiliated with a Party, that provide litigation support services (e.g., photocopying, videotaping, translating, preparing exhibits or demonstrations, and organizing, storing, or retrieving data in any form or medium) and their employees and subcontractors.

2.14 Protected Material: any Disclosure or Discovery Material that is designated as "CONFIDENTIAL."

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

2.15 Receiving Party: a Party that receives Disclosure or Discovery Material from a Producing Party.

3. SCOPE

The protections conferred by this Stipulation and Order cover not only Protected Material (as defined above), but also (1) any information copied or extracted from Protected Material; (2) all copies, excerpts, summaries, or compilations of Protected Material; and (3) any testimony, conversations, or presentations by Parties or their Counsel that might reveal Protected Material.

Any use of Protected Material at trial shall be governed by the orders of the trial judge. This Order does not govern the use of Protected Material at trial.

4. DURATION

Once a case proceeds to trial, information that was designated as CONFIDENTIAL or maintained pursuant to this protective order used or introduced as an exhibit at trial becomes public and will be presumptively available to all members of the public, including the press, unless compelling reasons supported by specific factual findings to proceed otherwise are made to the trial judge in advance of the trial. *See Kamakana*, 447 F.3d at 1180-81 (distinguishing “good cause” showing for sealing documents produced in discovery from “compelling reasons” standard when merits-related documents are part of court record). Accordingly, the terms of this protective order do not extend beyond the commencement of the trial.

///

5. DESIGNATING PROTECTED MATERIAL

5.1 Exercise of Restraint and Care in Designating Material for Protection.

Each Party or Non-Party that designates information or items for protection under this Order must take care to limit any such designation to specific material that qualifies under the appropriate standards. The

Holland & Knight LLP
400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Tel: 213.896.2400
Fax: 213.896.2450

1 Designating Party must designate for protection only those parts of
2 material, documents, items or oral or written communications that
3 qualify so that other portions of the material, documents, items or
4 communications for which protection is not warranted are not swept
5 unjustifiably within the ambit of this Order. Mass, indiscriminate or
6 routinized designations are prohibited. Designations that are shown to
7 be clearly unjustified or that have been made for an improper purpose
8 (e.g., to unnecessarily encumber the case development process or to
9 impose unnecessary expenses and burdens on other parties) may expose
10 the Designating Party to sanctions.

11 If it comes to a Designating Party's attention that information or items that it
12 designated for protection do not qualify for protection, that Designating Party must
13 promptly notify all other Parties that it is withdrawing the inapplicable designation.

14 **5.2 Manner and Timing of Designations.** Except as otherwise provided in
15 this Order, or as otherwise stipulated or ordered, Disclosure or
16 Discovery Material that qualifies for protection under this Order must
17 be clearly so designated before the material is disclosed or produced.

18 Designation in conformity with this Order requires:

- 19 (a) for information in documentary form (e.g., paper or electronic
20 documents, but excluding transcripts of depositions or other pretrial or
21 trial proceedings), that the Producing Party affix at a minimum, the
22 legend "CONFIDENTIAL" to each page that contains protected
23 material.
- 24 (b) for testimony given in depositions that the Designating Party identifies
25 the Disclosure or Discovery Material on the record, before the close of
26 the deposition all protected testimony.
- 27 (c) for information produced in some form other than documentary and for
28 any other tangible items, that the Producing Party affix in a prominent

1 place on the exterior of the container or containers in which the
2 information is stored the legend “CONFIDENTIAL.”

3 **5.3 Inadvertent Failures to Designate.** If timely corrected, an
4 inadvertent failure to designate qualified information or items does not,
5 standing alone, waive the Designating Party’s right to secure protection under
6 this Order for such material. Upon timely correction of a designation, the
7 Receiving Party must make reasonable efforts to assure that the material is
8 treated in accordance with the provisions of this Order.

9 **6. CHALLENGING CONFIDENTIALITY DESIGNATIONS**

10 **6.1 Timing of Challenges.** Any Party or Non-Party may challenge a
11 designation of confidentiality at any time that is consistent with the
12 Court’s Scheduling Order.

13 **6.2 Meet and Confer.** The Challenging Party shall initiate the dispute
14 resolution process under Local Rule 37-1 *et seq.*

15 **6.3 Joint Stipulation.** Any challenge submitted to the Court shall be via a
16 joint stipulation pursuant to Local Rule 37-2.

17 **6.4** The burden of persuasion in any such challenge proceeding shall be on
18 the Designating Party. Frivolous challenges, and those made for an
19 improper purpose (e.g., to harass or impose unnecessary expenses and
20 burdens on other parties) may expose the Challenging Party to
21 sanctions. Unless the Designating Party has waived or withdrawn the
22 confidentiality designation, all parties shall continue to afford the
23 material in question the level of protection to which it is entitled under
24 the Producing Party’s designation until the Court rules on the challenge.

25 **7. ACCESS TO AND USE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

26 **7.1 Basic Principles.** A Receiving Party may use Protected Material that is
27 disclosed or produced by another Party or by a Non-Party in connection
28 with this Action only, for prosecuting, defending or attempting to settle

1 this Action. Such Protected Material may be disclosed only to the
 2 categories of persons and under the conditions described in this Order.
 3 When the Action has been terminated, a Receiving Party must comply
 4 with the provisions of section 13 below (FINAL DISPOSITION).
 5 Protected Material must be stored and maintained by a Receiving Party
 6 at a location and in a secure manner that ensures that access is limited
 7 to the persons authorized under this Order.

8 **7.2** Disclosure of “CONFIDENTIAL” Information or Items. Unless
 9 otherwise ordered by the court or permitted in writing by the
 10 Designating Party, a Receiving Party may disclose any information or
 11 item designated “CONFIDENTIAL” only to:

- 12 (a) the Receiving Party’s Outside Counsel of Record in this action, as well
 13 as employees of said Outside Counsel of Record to whom it is
 14 reasonably necessary to disclose the information for this Action;
- 15 (b) the officers, directors, and employees (including House Counsel) of
 16 the Receiving Party to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for
 17 this Action;
- 18 (c) experts (as defined in this Order) of the Receiving Party to whom
 19 disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action and who have signed
 20 the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A);
- 21 (d) the court and its personnel;
- 22 (e) court reporters and their staff;
- 23 (f) professional jury or trial consultants, mock jurors, and Professional
 24 Vendors to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary for this Action
 25 and who have signed the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
 26 Bound” (Exhibit A);
- 27
- 28

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

(g) the author or recipient of a document containing the information or a custodian or other person who otherwise possessed or knew the information;

(h) during their depositions, witnesses, and attorneys for witnesses, in the Action to whom disclosure is reasonably necessary provided: (1) the deposing party requests that the witness sign the form attached as Exhibit 1 hereto; and (2) they will not be permitted to keep any confidential information unless they sign the “Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be Bound” (Exhibit A), unless otherwise agreed by the Designating Party or ordered by the court. Pages of transcribed deposition testimony or exhibits to depositions that reveal Protected Material may be separately bound by the court reporter and may not be disclosed to anyone except as permitted under this Stipulated Protective Order; and

(i) any mediator or settlement officer, and their supporting personnel, mutually agreed upon by any of the parties engaged in settlement discussions.

8. PROTECTED MATERIAL SUBPOENAED OR ORDERED PRODUCED IN OTHER LITIGATION

If a Party is served with a subpoena or a court order issued in other litigation that compels disclosure of any information or items designated in this Action as “CONFIDENTIAL,” that Party must:

(a) promptly notify in writing the Designating Party. Such notification shall include a copy of the subpoena or court order;

(b) promptly notify in writing the party who caused the subpoena or order to issue in the other litigation that some or all of the material covered by the subpoena or order is subject to this Protective Order. Such notification shall include a copy of this Protective Order; and

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

(c) cooperate with respect to all reasonable procedures sought to be pursued by the Designating Party whose Protected Material may be affected. If the Designating Party timely seeks a protective order, the Party served with the subpoena or court order shall not produce any information designated in this action as “CONFIDENTIAL” before a determination by the court from which the subpoena or order issued, unless the Party has obtained the Designating Party’s permission. The Designating Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in that court of its confidential material and nothing in these provisions should be construed as authorizing or encouraging a Receiving Party in this Action to disobey a lawful directive from another court.

9. A NON-PARTY’S PROTECTED MATERIAL SOUGHT TO BE PRODUCED IN THIS LITIGATION

(a) The terms of this Order are applicable to information produced by a Non-Party in this Action and designated as “CONFIDENTIAL.” Such information produced by Non-Parties in connection with this litigation is protected by the remedies and relief provided by this Order. Nothing in these provisions should be construed as prohibiting a Non-Party from seeking additional protections.

(b) In the event that a Party is required, by a valid discovery request, to produce a Non-Party’s confidential information in its possession, and the Party is subject to an agreement with the Non-Party not to produce the Non-Party’s confidential information, then the Party shall:

- 1) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;
- 2) promptly notify in writing the Requesting Party and the Non-Party that some or all of the information requested is subject to a confidentiality agreement with a Non-Party;

1 3) make the information requested available for inspection by the
2 Non-Party, if requested.

3 (c) If the Non-Party fails to seek a protective order from this court
4 within 14 days of receiving the notice and accompanying information, the
5 Receiving Party may produce the Non-Party's confidential information
6 responsive to the discovery request. If the Non-Party timely seeks a protective
7 order, the Receiving Party shall not produce any information in its possession
8 or control that is subject to the confidentiality agreement with the Non-Party
9 before a determination by the court. Absent a court order to the contrary, the
10 Non-Party shall bear the burden and expense of seeking protection in this
11 court of its Protected Material.

12 **10. UNAUTHORIZED DISCLOSURE OF PROTECTED MATERIAL**

13 If a Receiving Party learns that, by inadvertence or otherwise, it has
14 disclosed Protected Material to any person or in any circumstance not
15 authorized under this Stipulated Protective Order, the Receiving Party must
16 immediately (a) notify in writing the Designating Party of the unauthorized
17 disclosures, (b) use its best efforts to retrieve all unauthorized copies of the
18 Protected Material, (c) inform the person or persons to whom unauthorized
19 disclosures were made of all the terms of this Order, and (d) request such
20 person or persons to execute the "Acknowledgment and Agreement to Be
21 Bound" that is attached hereto as Exhibit A.

22 **11. INADVERTENT PRODUCTION OF PRIVILEGED OR** 23 **OTHERWISE PROTECTED MATERIAL**

24 When a Producing Party gives notice to Receiving Parties that certain
25 inadvertently produced material is subject to a claim of privilege or other
26 protection, the obligations of the Receiving Parties are those set forth in
27 Federal Rule of Civil Procedure 26(b)(5)(B). This provision is not intended
28 to modify whatever procedure may be established in an e-discovery order that

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

provides for production without prior privilege review. Pursuant to Federal Rule of Evidence 502(d) and (e), insofar as the parties reach an agreement on the effect of disclosure of a communication or information covered by the attorney-client privilege or work product protection, the parties may incorporate their agreement in the stipulated protective order submitted to the court.

12. MISCELLANEOUS

12.1 Right to Further Relief. Nothing in this Order abridges the right of any person to seek its modification by the court in the future.

12.2 Right to Assert Other Objections. By stipulating to the entry of this Protective Order, no Party waives any right it otherwise would have to object to disclosing or producing any information or item on any ground not addressed in this Stipulated Protective Order. Similarly, no Party waives any right to object on any ground to use in evidence of any of the material covered by this Protective Order.

12.3 Filing Protected Material. A Party that seeks to file under seal any Protected Material must comply with Local Civil Rule 79-5. Protected Material may only be filed under seal pursuant to a court order authorizing the sealing of the specific Protected Material at issue. If a Party's request to file Protected Material under seal is denied by the court, then the Receiving Party may file the information in the public record unless otherwise instructed by the court.

13. FINAL DISPOSITION

After the final disposition of this Action, as defined in paragraph 4, within 60 days of a written request by the Designating Party, each Receiving Party must return all Protected Material to the Producing Party or destroy such material. As used in this subdivision, "all Protected Material" includes all copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries, and any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Whether the Protected Material is returned or destroyed, the Receiving

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

Party must submit a written certification to the Producing Party (and, if not the same person or entity, to the Designating Party) by the 60 day deadline that (1) identifies (by category, where appropriate) all the Protected Material that was returned or destroyed and (2) affirms that the Receiving Party has not retained any copies, abstracts, compilations, summaries or any other format reproducing or capturing any of the Protected Material. Notwithstanding this provision, Counsel are entitled to retain an archival copy of all pleadings, motion papers, trial, deposition, and hearing transcripts, legal memoranda, correspondence, deposition and trial exhibits, expert reports, attorney work product, and consultant and expert work product, even if such materials contain Protected Material. Any such archival copies that contain or constitute Protected Material remain subject to this Protective Order as set forth in Section 4.

14. VIOLATION

Any violation of this Order may be punished by appropriate measures including, without limitation, contempt proceedings and/or monetary sanctions.

IT IS SO STIPULATED.

Dated: June 14, 2023

HOLLAND & KNIGHT LLP

By: /s/ Zachary C. Frampton
 Zachary C. Frampton

*Attorneys for Defendants
 Hyundai Capital America, Inc.
 and Coastline Recovery Services, Inc.*

Dated: June 14, 2023

SWIGART LAW GROUP, APC
 DANIEL SHAY LAW OFFICES

By: /s/ Joshua B. Swigart

Joshua B. Swigart
Spencer L. Pfeiff
Daniel Guinn Shay

*Attorneys for Plaintiffs
Gene Wechsler and Bridgette Wechsler*

FOR GOOD CAUSE SHOWN, IT IS SO ORDERED.

DATED: 6/14/2023

/s/ Charles F. Eick

HON. CHARLES F. EICK
United States Magistrate Judge

Holland & Knight LLP
400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
Los Angeles, CA 90071
Tel: 213.896.2400
Fax: 213.896.2450

Holland & Knight LLP
 400 South Hope Street, 8th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071
 Tel: 213.896.2400
 Fax: 213.896.2450

EXHIBIT A

ACKNOWLEDGMENT AND AGREEMENT TO BE BOUND

I, _____ [print or type full name], of
 _____ [print or type full address], declare under
 penalty of perjury that I have read in its entirety and understand the Stipulated
 Protective Order that was issued by the United States District Court for the Central
 District of California on _____, 20__ in the case of *Gene Wechsler, et al. v. Hyundai*
Capital America, et al, Case No. 2:22-cv-08599-AB-E. I agree to comply with and
 to be bound by all the terms of this Stipulated Protective Order and I understand and
 acknowledge that failure to so comply could expose me to sanctions and punishment
 in the nature of contempt. I solemnly promise that I will not disclose in any manner
 any information or item that is subject to this Stipulated Protective Order to any
 person or entity except in strict compliance with the provisions of this Order. I
 further agree to submit to the jurisdiction of the United States District Court for the
 Central District of California for enforcing the terms of this Stipulated Protective
 Order, even if such enforcement proceedings occur after termination of this action.

I hereby appoint _____ [print or type full name] of
 _____ [print or type full address and
 telephone number] as my California agent for service of process in connection with
 this action or any proceedings related to enforcement of this Stipulated Protective
 Order.

Date: _____

City and State where sworn and signed: _____

Printed name: _____

Signature: _____